United States District Court Southern District of Texas

ENTERED

November 14, 2016 David J. Bradley, Clerk

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS HOUSTON DIVISION

WESTERNGECO LLC, et al,

Plaintiffs,

VS.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 4:09-CV-1827

Solution of the state of the state

ORDER

Pending before the Court are WesternGeco L.L.C.'s ("WesternGeco") Motion to Enforce Royalty Damages (Doc. No. 696), ION Geophysical Corporation's ("ION") Motion for a Stay, or for Relief under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 60(b)(6) (Doc. No. 700), and Arch Insurance Company and Westchester Fire Insurance Company's ("the Sureties") Motion to Release/Discharge Supersedeas Bond Relative to Liability for Lost Profits Damages Reversed on Appeal (Doc. No. 721).

On May 4, 2016, United States Magistrate Judge Dena Hanovice Palermo issued an Order and Report and Recommendation (R&R) recommending that the Court issue a final judgment, recommending that ION's motion for relief be denied, ordering that WesternGeco's motion be granted, ordering that the Sureties' motion be denied, and ordering that ION's motion for a stay be denied. (Doc. No. 725.) Defendant and the Sureties timely filed Objections to, and appealed, Judge Palermo's Order and R & R (Doc. Nos. 726 & 727). Plaintiff filed a Response (Doc. No. 729), and a hearing was held.

As required by 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(C), the Court has conducted a de novo review of the portions of the R & R to which Defendant and the Sureties objected. Additionally, as

required by 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(A), the Court has reviewed the objected-to portions of the

Order under the clearly erroneous standard. The Court agrees with the conclusions, and the

reasoning, of the Order and R & R, with two exceptions. First, the Court will not enter a final

judgment in the case until after enhanced damages have been considered, in accordance with the

Federal Circuit mandate. (Doc. No. 748.) Additionally, the Court releases the Sureties from the

supersedeas bond inasmuch as it covers ION's exposure over \$65,000,000.

Accordingly, the Court PARTIALLY AFFIRMS the Order and ADOPTS the R & R.

WesternGeco's Motion To Enforce Royalty Damages against the Sureties is GRANTED, ION's

Motion for Stay or for Relief under Rule 60 is **DENIED**, and the Sureties Motion for Release

from Bond is **PARTIALLY GRANTED**.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

SIGNED in Houston, Texas, on this the an day of November, 2016.

KETSH P ELLISON

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE